



MINUTES OF DONOR COORDINATION MEETING

5th November 2017

Landmark Mekong Riverside Hotel, Vientiane, Lao PDR

1. DATE AND VENUE

- 1.1 The 2017 ASEAN Supreme Audit Institutions (**ASEANSAL**) Donor Coordination Meeting was held on 5th November 2017.
- 1.2 The event took place in Diamond Room, Landmark Mekong Riverside Hotel, Vientiane, Lao PDR.

2. PARTICIPANTS OF THE 2017 ASEANSAL DONOR COORDINATION MEETING

- 2.1 The 2017 ASEANSAL Donor Coordination Meeting was attended by 44 delegates/representatives from:
- i) Jabatan Audit Brunei Darussalam (**SAI Brunei**);
 - ii) National Audit Authority of Kingdom of Cambodia (**SAI Cambodia**);
 - iii) The Audit Board of the Republic of Indonesia (**SAI Indonesia**);
 - iv) The State Audit Organization of Lao P.D.R. (**SAI Lao**);
 - v) Jabatan Audit Negara Malaysia (**SAI Malaysia**);
 - vi) Office of the Auditor General of the Union, the Republic of the Union of Myanmar (**SAI Myanmar**);
 - vii) The Commission on Audit of the Republic of Philippines (**SAI Philippines**);
 - viii) Auditor-General's Office of Singapore (**SAI Singapore**);
 - ix) Office of the Auditor General of Thailand (**SAI Thailand**);
 - x) State Audit Office of Vietnam (**SAI Vietnam**);
 - xi) Asian Development Bank (ADB) from Manila Regional Office and ADB Lao resident Mission;
 - xii) Delegation of the European Union (EU) to Lao PDR ;

- xiii) German Government (GIZ);
- xiv) Office of the Auditor General of Norway (SAI Norway);
- xv) Swedish National Audit Office (SAI Sweden); and
- xvi) World Bank.

The list of attendees is as attached in **ANNEX 1**.

3. OPENING SPEECH FROM THE PRESIDENT OF THE STATE AUDIT ORGANIZATION OF LAO PDR

3.1 Her Excellency Dr. Viengthong Siphandone, Vice Chairperson of ASEANSAI and President of the State Audit Organization of Lao PDR delivered her Opening Speech.

3.2 In her speech, Her Excellency Dr. Viengthong Siphandone:

- ❖ conveyed her warm welcome to all representatives of ASEANSAI members and development partners such as ADB, British Embassy in Vientiane, European Union to Lao PDR, German Government, SAI Norway, SAI Sweden, and the World Bank in the 2017 ASEANSAI Donor Coordination Meeting.
- ❖ explained that past successes of ASEANSAI in promoting competency development of auditors and in developing ISSAI auditing standards is one of the milestones in ASEANSAI's 6-year history.
- ❖ as Vice Chairperson of ASEANSAI and the next term of ASEANSAI Chairperson, showed her interest to engaging with the ASEANSAI Secretariat to establish a platform to integrate the technical features required to meet the mutual targets on a stable and established basis.
- ❖ Informed attendees that the main objective of the 2017 ASEANSAI Donor Coordination Meeting is to reflect on past relationship, to develop new relationship and to chart a way forward between ASEANSAI and development partners.

The full text of the Welcoming Address is as attached in **ANNEX 2**.

4. STATEMENT FROM CHAIRMAN OF THE AUDIT BOARD OF THE REPUBLIC OF INDONESIA

4.1 His Excellency Dr. Moermahadi Soerja Djanegara, Chairman of the Audit Board of the Republic of Indonesia delivered his statement.

4.2 In his speech, His Excellency Dr. Moermahadi Soerja Djanegara:

- ❖ expressed his gratitude to all attendees for agreeing to join in with the 2017 ASEANSAI Donor Coordination Meeting.
- ❖ pointed that a deeper strength and competency in public auditing is one of the needed matters, and ASEANSAI with the assistance of International partners, is moving forward with ISSAI best practice development and knowledge sharing. Therefore, all members of ASEANSAI recognize and appreciate the invaluable support of international partners.
- ❖ explained that in escalating the role of ASEANSAI in regional and national levels, SAI Indonesia supports the implementation of ISSAI and other INTOSAI good practices, promote good performance of member SAIs, support member SAIs to fulfill their role towards the successful achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals, strengthen ASEANSAI's active role within ASEAN agenda and improve the cooperation with regional and international partners. Further, as the head of ASEANSAI Secretariat, Mr. Hendar Ristriawan will be hoping to formalize new long-term and flexible arrangements with each international partner within a Donor-Forum arrangement, giving benefits of an outlook-driven approach for shared capacity building objectives.
- ❖ pointed that the 2017 ASEANSAI Donor Coordination Meeting is a platform for coordination among donors, implementers and SAIs to create synergy for donors and ensure the alignment of activities. Further, SAI Indonesia, in the capacity as ASEANSAI Secretariat, welcome the donor's support in helping to achieve effectiveness and efficiency, and to achieve sustainable stakeholder satisfaction while ASEANSAI pushes forward with its new strategic plan.

The full text of the Statement is as attached in **ANNEX 3**.

5. PHOTO SESSION

5.1 After the speeches, there were group photos for all delegates and guests.

6. PRESENTATION FROM EACH ASEANSAL COMMITTEE CHAIRS ON ITS PRIORITIZED PROJECTS

6.1 The Honorable Mr. Hendar Ristriawan presided the 2017 ASEANSAL Donor Coordination Meeting and opened the meeting by explaining the rules and proceeding of the meeting and information about the meeting agenda. Further, he invited all the donors to introduce themselves briefly.

- 1) Representative from GIZ introduced its delegates and explained its focus of cooperation as the following:
 - a) The German government has been supporting ASEANSAL since 2013 and it will end in 2018.
 - b) GIZ works with ASEANSAL as the regional organization in organizational development, supporting the ASEANSAL through its committees and aligning its support with the strategic plan of ASEANSAL.
- 2) Representative from World Bank introduced himself and expressed his heartfelt since he witnessed the establishment of ASEANSAL in 2011. The World Bank also witnessed the process of ASEANSAL sharing knowledge and capacity building. Currently, the World Bank has supported ASEANSAL in the area of ISSAI Implementation; this project shows good relationship and coordination among donors working together in ASEANSAL.
- 3) Representative from Swedish National Audit Office (SNAO) introduce its delegates and informed that the involvement of SNAO in the ASEAN starting in 2013 jointly with the GIZ Project.
- 4) Representative from ADB introduced its delegates and pointed out his involvement in the INTOSAI Donor Cooperation. He mentioned about the initiative of Global Call for Proposal from the INTOSAI where SAI can submit online proposal for its strategic plan and work plan to obtain funding.
He also extended a general invitation that ADB will host a programme from IPSAS Board in May 2018.
- 5) Representative from SAI Norway introduced its delegates and informed that they have been involved with seven countries and one region (AFROSAI-e). He pointed out 4 focus areas: audit on extractive industries, IT Audit, Developing

Audit Management System and Environmental Audit. SAI Norway also actively participates in the development of SAI Performance Measurement Framework (PMF). He emphasized the need for synergies between bilateral and regional support.

- 6) Representative from European Union (EU) introduced its delegate and pointed out that EU has been increasingly engaging with SAIs, particularly in the regional level. They aimed at strengthening the accountability system and in this occasion they saw the opportunity in engaging increasingly with ASEANSAI (1) region to region dialogue and (2) ASEANSAI can represent a very useful platform to support further trilateral cooperation in the region. The EU intends to leverage the differences among SAIs in the region and work together with ASEANSAI and SAI in the region to strengthen the SAI cooperation. They expressed its willingness to engage with the continuation of the donor coordination meeting.

6.2 INTOSAI Donor Secretariat sent a video recording which was presented during the meeting. They presented about the Global Call for Proposal (GCP):

- a. INTOSAI Donor Cooperation is a strategic partnership between the International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions (INTOSAI) and the Donor Community.
- b. The GCP seeks to match SAI capacity development proposals with donor funding or INTOSAI support. In this way it empowers SAIs in developing countries to drive forward their capacity and performance by ensuring that their proposals are SAI-led and aligned with the individual SAI's strategic plans.
- c. The support are provided by:
 - Development banks
 - Donor agencies
 - The SAI Capacity Development Fund
 - The INTOSAI Development Initiative
 - SAIs with their own development resources like Norway and Sweden
 - SAIs with in-kind support like India, Brazil and Mexico.
- d. The GCP provide multiple benefits, and can open numerous doors for SAIs:
 - Providing a gateway to multiple donors and providers of support.
 - Rolling process and proposals can therefore be submitted at any time. This essentially means SAI can adapt its submission to the donor processes and programme cycles, increasing the chances of success.

- The programme provides stronger peer to peer to support, as well as assistance with concept note development, and also ensures improved coordination amongst providers of support.

6.2 Presentation of Strategic Planning Committee

6.2.1 The Honorable Mr. Hendar Ristriawan invited Ms. Do Thi Binh from SAI Vietnam as the representative of the Chair of ASEANSAI Strategic Planning Committee to present the prioritized projects of ASEANSAI Strategic Planning Committee.

6.2.2 In her presentation, Ms. Binh explained two prioritized projects of ASEANSAI Strategic Planning Committee, which are to coordinate with Committees Chairs on upgrading ASEANSAI's current Monitoring & Evaluation System (MES); and to support SPC in developing the ASEANSAI Strategic Plan 2022 – 2027. The presentation slide is as attached in **ANNEX 4**.

6.3 Presentation of Training Committee

6.3.1 The Honorable Mr. Hendar Ristriawan invited Ms. Luz L. Tolentino from SAI Philippines as the representative of the Chair of ASEANSAI Training Committee to present the prioritized projects of ASEANSAI Training Committee.

6.3.2 In her presentation, Ms. Tolentino proposed three prioritized projects from ASEANSAI Training Committee, which are ASEANSAI Follow-Up Workshop on the Audit of Public Procurement (FUWAPP); Workshop on the Audit on Preparedness of Countries for Implementation of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs); and Workshop on SAI Performance Measurement Framework (SAI PMF) for Future Assessors. More details about the projects can be seen in the slide presentation as attached in **ANNEX 5a**.

6.3.2 Ms. Tolentino also presented success stories of the ISSAI Implementation Programme on ASEANSAI (Long Term ASEANSAI Programme on ISSAI Implementation – LTAPII). She presented the success factor of LTAPII which involved ASEANSAI internal capacity (ISSAI Facilitators and Training Specialist of IDI, IT infrastructure, strong leadership and commitment of capacity building),

commitment and support of external partners (financial support from GIZ and World Bank) and technical assistance from Swedish National Audit Office (SNAO).

The presentation slide as attached in **ANNEX 5b**.

6.4 Presentation of Knowledge Sharing Committee

6.4.1 The Honorable Mr. Hendar Ristriawan invited Mr. Roslan bin Abu Bakar from SAI Malaysia as the representative of the Chair of ASEANSAI Knowledge Sharing Committee to present the prioritized projects of ASEANSAI Knowledge Sharing Committee.

6.4.2 In his presentation, Mr. Roslan explained two prioritized project from ASEANSAI Knowledge Sharing Committee, which are good practices on SAI independence and sustainable development related issues. More details about the projects can be seen in the slide presentation as attached in **ANNEX 6**.

6.5 Discussion

6.5.1 After the presentations on the prioritized projects by ASEANSAI Committees, The Honorable Mr. Hendar Ristriawan invited all donors to give questions for the committees. Further, he introduced Mr. R. Yudi Ramdan from the ASEANSAI Secretariat to assist him in moderating the discussion.

6.5.2 Mr. Trygve Christiansen from SAI Norway expressed its interest to the implementation of SAI Performance Measurement Framework (PMF). SAI Norway is of the view that it would be very interesting to have a dialogue and they were offering support in kind to increase awareness in the region and in carrying out self assessment. They recognized the tools as new tools and sometimes can be sensitive for implementation.

SAI Norway sought clarification on whether ASEANSAI has concrete activities on how to implement the tools or to increase awareness and how the activities will relate to the IDI.

6.5.3 Ms. Tolentino clarified that since the decisions lies with the respective Auditor-General, the SAI should be building the awareness first to convince the Auditor-General before proceeds further. She opined that creating awareness is a good strategy then self-assessment and followed by improving the SAI performance.

6.5.4 Mr. Srinivasan Janardanam from ADB commented on the process of SAI PMF application. SAI PMF is intended to be self assessment by the Auditor General then as a follow on to that, strategy and action plan developed which can be implemented appropriately depending on the issue of sensitivity.

He also mentioned another issue faced by the ADB related to accountability of project financial reporting and auditing which experienced delay in reporting and interfered with the quality and use of the report.

6.5.5 Ms. Karin Holmerin from Swedish National Audit Office (SNAO) offers the possible contribution from SNAO to ASEANSAI, based on the needs of ASEANSAI committees for outside expertise and area of support.

She also suggested the strategy on how to deal with the issue of sensitivity on the implementation of SAI PMF. Rather than to reveal the conclusion, it would be more beneficial to discuss the experience, process and how to manage it.

6.5.6 Ms. Tolentino pointed out the need from Training Committee that the expert needed would be based on the result of self-assessment, prioritization and identification.

6.5.7 Mr. Roslan from Knowledge Sharing Committee emphasized the ISSAI-based activities conducted by the ASEANSAI. Therefore, the expertise is expected to be knowledgeable on ISSAI and enriched with experience. He highlighted the importance of the expert to boost the confidence and good exposure to learn from developed country.

6.5.8 Ms. Binh from Strategic Planning Committee emphasize the need to upgrade the Monitoring and Evaluation System (MES), she intend to develop different tools to set the Key Performance Indicator (KPI) including setting of appropriate baseline.

6.5.9 Mr. Daniel Blessing from GIZ expressed its interest to continue the support to upgrade the MES and sought clarification on whether there will be longer term project for the Audit on Public Procurement or it will be scaled at the bilateral level.

6.5.10 Ms. Tolentino responded to GIZ by explaining that there is a need for the Follow Up Workshop on Audit of Public Procurement (FUWAPP) to expand its participants to ensure the involvement of SAIs.

6.5.11 Ms. Holmerin confirmed to support ASEANSAI by providing expert especially in relation to the Strategic Plan. She mentioned the need to provide clear timing for the support needed to arrange availability of the expert.

6.5.8 In the end of the discussion session, Mr. Ramdan concluded that

- ❖ Some donors expressed its interests on the following:
 - 1) SAI Norway offers to provide expertise on SAI PMF through sharing of experience
 - 2) SAI Sweden offers to continue supporting the LTAPII and to provide expertise on Strategic Plan to assist ASEANSAI Strategic Planning Committee (SPC) develop the next strategic plans.
 - 3) GIZ offers its support for upgrading the MES.
- ❖ To manage the relationship with the donors, it was agreed to conduct two main activities, which are focus on the coordination and information among donors working with SAI in ASEAN and ASEANSAI; and the support to ASEANSAI as organization and its regional activities.
- ❖ In coordinating and sharing information among donors working with SAI in ASEAN and ASEANSAI, it is planned to be done by sharing information via ASEANSAI newsletter, and developing an information-portal for the ASEANSAI-Donor forum that will be included in the ASEANSAI website.
- ❖ In the future, the information-portal will contain information on capacity building program undertaken by ASEANSAI including the information on support by the relevant donors as well as the information on any bilateral or multilateral cooperation between ASEANSAI member SAI and donors.
- ❖ The ASEANSAI Secretariat will be in the lead to create the information portal and expect input from each of the development partner to achieve a comprehensive overview on the activities.

- ❖ In focusing on support to ASEANSAI as organization and its regional activities, it was agreed that a scoping mission is an initial activity that must be conducted before donors support ASEANSAI. It aims to match the expectation between the donors and ASEANSAI, and can define the area of cooperation and clarify the needs of the SAI. In the future, the ASEANSAI Secretariat will assist to arrange the missions jointly with the relevant committee chairs and serve as an entry point for donors. Further, ASEANSAI Strategic Plan will be the outline for the scoping missions.

7. CLOSING

- 7.1 The Honorable Mr. Hendar Ristriawan expressed his satisfaction on the meeting results. He pointed that all attendees need to agree on the technical details of the new foundation between donors and ASEANSAI. The ASEANSAI Secretariat will contact all attendees to move forward on the issue.
- 7.2 Further, as the Head of the ASEANSAI Secretariat, he conveyed his appreciation for the active participation of all attendees in the 2017 ASEANSAI Donor Coordination Meeting.
The presentation Head of Secretariat can be seen in **ANNEX 7**.
- 7.3 There were no other matters, the meeting ended at 12.30 PM.